

City of Oconomowoc
Public Services Committee
Aldermen: Ellis, Chairman / Rosek, Secy / Mulder

Tuesday, September 01, 2020 - 6:40 PM
City Hall - Council Chambers



Notice: If a person with a disability requires that the meeting be accessible or that materials at the meeting be in accessible format, call the City Clerk at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to request adequate accommodations. Tel: 569-2186.

1. Call to order and confirmation of appropriate meeting notification
2. Committee Business
 - a. Consider/recommend Awarding 2021 Thackeray Trail Reconstruction Design Engineering Services
 - b. Consider/recommend Approving Collins Parking Lot Construction Bid
3. Adjourn

Diane Coenen, City Clerk
City of Oconomowoc

Notice is hereby given that a majority of the Common Council will be present at the above scheduled meeting to gather information about a subject over which they have decision-making responsibility. This constitutes a meeting of the Common Council pursuant to State ex rel. Badke v. Greendale Village Board, 173Wis. 2d 553, 494 N.W. 2d 408 (1993) and must be noticed as such, although the Common Council will not take any formal action at this meeting.



MEMORANDUM

PUBLIC WORKS

Date: September 1, 2020

To: Common Council
Public Services Committee

From: Mark Frye, Director of Public Works

Re: Approve Engineering Consultant for 2021 Thackeray Trail Reconstruction Design Services

RELATES TO THE STRATEGIC PLAN

Strategic Goal-
Section II: Improve and Maintain Our Infrastructure and Facilities
Part B: Maintain Our Existing Infrastructure

BACKGROUND

On September 17, 2019, the Common Council approved a cross section for the existing Thackeray Trail reconstruction. As part of the approval, sidewalk and stormsewer were approved to extend in to Emerson, Whitter and Longfellow.

A Request for Proposal (RFP) was completed and sent out on July 17, 2020. The RFP required a Not-to-Exceed (NTE) cost for the tasks associated with the design work. The tasks are listed below.

- Task 1 Pre Design Meeting
- Task 2 Permitting
- Task 3 Stormwater Pond
- Task 4 Traffic Analysis
- Task 5 Utility Design
- Task 6 Council, Committee and Public Meetings
- Task 7 Review of 60% Plans
- Task 8 Final Review Meeting
- Task 9 Project Bidding
- Task 10 Post Bid Tasks
- Task 11 Engineering Support Services during Construction
- Task 12 Estimate Hours Required for Construction Management

We utilize the hybrid QBS (Qualifications Based Selection) process to evaluate proposals. This hybrid evaluation process includes a technical evaluation consisting of 80% of points and cost evaluation consisting of 20% of points. The consultant with the highest combined total of points will be recommended to Council for approval with the not to exceed cost plus authorization for staff to execute a 10% contingency.

The RFP was requested by 12 firms and sent to an additional 15. Six proposals were received on Monday, August 10, 2020.

ADDITIONAL ANALYSIS

Proposals were reviewed and scored by Mark Frye, Director of Public Works, David Stoiser, Assistant Director of Public Works, Joe Pickart, Utility Manager and Kevin Freber, Wastewater Treatment Plant Manager. One of the firms did not meet the 80% point requirement for further consideration. The scoring summary and the not-to-exceed cost information is shown below. One of the firms did not obtain the minimum 80% of the points so their cost envelope was not opened. After opening the envelopes of the remaining five firms, one was determined to be non-responsive due to missing required items.

City of Oconomowoc									
Thackeray Trail Reconstruction Design									
August 10, 2020									
Technical Score									
	Total Points	Average Points	Rank						
Baxter and Woodman	339	84.8	4						
Clark Dietz	367	91.8	2						
Collins Engineering	339	84.8	4						
M Squared	309	77.3	6						
Strand	370	92.5	1						
Viebichner	347	86.8	3						
Total Possible Points	400	100.0							
Average Technical Score with Pricing Factor									
	Quality and Completeness	Project Understanding	Experience and Technical Expertise	Staff Qualifications and Experience	Contract Cost Points	Total Points	Proposal Cost	% Cost Points	Rank
Baxter and Woodman	21.8	21.5	20.3	21.3	25.0	109.9	\$ 142,433	100%	1
Clark Dietz	24.3	25.0	20.8	21.8	15.4	107.3	\$ 231,380	62%	3
Collins Engineering	23.5	19.3	19.8	22.3	18.9	103.8	\$ 188,095	76%	4
Strand	24.5	24.3	22.3	21.5	14.9	107.5	\$ 239,305	60%	2
Viebichner	24.5	19.8	21.0	21.5			Non Responsive		

The projects contained in the RFP are:

Thackeray Trail Reconstruction:

The existing street, 2,900 LF, is a rural section that will be reconstructed to a 37-foot face-to-face cross section with sidewalk, street trees curb and gutter and storm sewer. A new pond will be part of the design to receive the discharge from the storm sewer. Design replacement of the watermain and laterals and rehabilitation of the sanitary sewer main and manholes will be included in the project scope. Sidewalks curb and storm sewer will extend into Whittier, Longfellow and Emerson to completed the urban cross section. Traffic analysis will need to be completed as part of the design for the intersection of Summit Avenue to determine turn lanes, signage and signal timing. Access to the Whitman Park Shopping Center will need to be reviewed with any improvements included in the final design. Street trees are to be included along the entire length of the reconstruction. With the wide right-of-way we want a mixture of species and placed on both sides of the sidewalk on both sides of the street.

Project Phasing:

The project improvements phasing needs to provide for the following:

- Access to businesses
- Access to residential driveways each night (except for 7 day concrete cure time)
- Reconstruct from Emerson Drive to the newly constructed extension to Silver Lake Street first to provide a second and emergency access for use by residents during construction

Thackeray Trail Extension Surface Course:

The street extension from Silver Lake Street 2,600 LF to the east is already constructed and has curb and asphalt binder complete. The City wants the surface course for the extension completed with the surfacing of the reconstruction and included as a separate line item in the bid (accounting reasons). The asphalt from the intersection of Silver Lake Street going easterly for 420 LF will be pulverized and overlaid as part of the reconstruction project

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Based on the proposal received from Baxter and Woodman a Not-to-Exceed cost of \$142,433 plus a 10% contingency of \$14,243 for a total of \$156,676.

RECOMMENDATION

Public Services Committee: Motion to recommend to the Common Council acceptance of the Not-to-Exceed proposal from Baxter & Woodman in the amount of \$142,433, plus a 10% contingency of \$14,243, total of \$156,676 charged to Account Number 408.505.5300.210 #419510.01, Thackeray Trail Reconstruction Design Engineering.

SUGGESTED MOTION

Common Council: Motion to approve resolution 20-R2886.

RESOLUTION NO. 20-R2886

**RESOLUTION AWARDDING 2021 THACKERAY TRAIL RECONSTRUCTION
DESIGN ENGINEERING SERVICES**

WHEREAS, design engineering services are required for the 2021 Reconstruction of Thackeray Trail; and

WHEREAS, Department of Public Works representatives prepared a Request for Proposal advertisement, published the same, and based thereon received six proposals; and

WHEREAS, City staff followed Procurement Policy for professional services and used a combined approach to evaluate proposals by weighting 80% of the points for the technical evaluation and 20% for cost, so cost is incorporated as a factor; and

WHEREAS, one of the firms did not receive the required 80% of the points to have their cost envelope opened; and

WHEREAS, one firm was missing required information in their cost proposal and determined to be non-responsive; and

WHEREAS, based on the evaluation process completed by the Director of Public Works, Assistant Director of Public Works, Utility Manager and Wastewater Utility Manager the final four firms were ranked as follows:

1. Baxter and Woodman
2. Strand
3. Clark Dietz
4. Collins

WHEREAS, the proposal from Baxter and Woodman to complete the design engineering services, permitting, pond design, traffic analysis, respond to construction related questions, attend meetings and preparation of record drawings for the 2021 Thackeray Trail Reconstruction is a Not-to-Exceed cost of \$142,433; and

WHEREAS, Baxter and Woodman has performed design engineering services previously for the City and their performance has been satisfactory; and

WHEREAS, City staff and the Public Services Committee recommend that the proposal of Baxter and Woodman in the amount of \$142,433 for design engineering services, permitting, pond design, traffic analysis, respond to construction related questions, attend meetings and preparation of record drawings for the 2021 Thackeray Trail Reconstruction be accepted.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT HEREBY RESOLVED the proposal of Baxter and Woodman in the sum of \$142,433 be and the same is hereby accepted, and appropriate City officials are authorized to enter into a contract with Baxter and Woodman for said work.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED this is a Not-to-Exceed price proposal with a 10% contingency of \$14,243 for a total cost of \$156,676.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED Task 11 of the Request for Proposals relates to the cost of the design firm responding to questions during project construction; this task is a time and material not-to-exceed cost basis so we only pay for the actual hours required.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the project cost will be charged to the following account number:

408.505.5300.210 #419510.01, Thackeray Trail Reconstruction Design Engineering

DATED: _____

CITY OF OCONOMOWOC

By: _____
Robert P. Magnus, Mayor

ATTEST:

Diane Coenen, Clerk



MEMORANDUM

PUBLIC WORKS

Date: September 1, 2020
 To: Common Council
 Public Services Committee
 From: Mark Frye, Director of Public Works
 Re: Collins Lot Reconstruction Bids

RELATES TO THE STRATEGIC PLAN

Strategic Goal II Improve and Maintain Our Infrastructure/Facilities
 B Maintain our Existing Infrastructure

BACKGROUND

Bids were advertised and opened for the Reconstruction of the Collins Street Parking Lot on August 20, 2020. Four bids were received as follows:

	Base	Alternate 1	Alternate 2	Total Bid
Contractor	Bid	Bid	Bid	with Alternates
Musson Brothers	\$ 728,259.77	\$ 54,760.00	\$ 5,689.36	\$ 788,709.13
Super Western	\$ 828,198.73	\$ 128,686.00	\$ 5,800.00	\$ 962,684.73
Poblocki Paving	\$ 998,877.00	\$ 68,450.00	\$ 8,220.00	\$ 1,075,547.00
Zignego	\$ 1,228,822.27	\$ 136,900.00	\$ 7,131.00	\$ 1,372,853.27

Base Bid Scope of Work

The work under this contract shall consist of the reconstruction of parking lot pavement, including pavement removal, tree removal, curb and gutter removal, retaining wall removal, stairs removal, storm sewer removal, lighting removal, earthwork, base preparation and repairs, new base aggregate and HMA pavement, storm sewer, lighting, bioretention basin, landscaping, and all incidental items necessary to complete the work as shown on the plans and included in the proposal and contract.

Alternate 1 Private Pavement Replacement

All saw cutting; removing asphaltic pavement; grading, shaping, and compacting the underlying aggregate base; furnishing and placing asphaltic pavement; and all other work necessary to complete the work of this special provision.

Alternate 2 Remove and Replace Electric Vehicle Charging Station

Staff is recommending accepting both Alternates at an additional cost of \$60,449.36.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

The total project cost, including Alternates 1 and 2, is \$788,709.13. As per City Policy, this is a unit priced bid with the actual cost based on the units required to complete the work. A 10% contingency (\$78,870) is allowed for the construction. Net approved project cost is \$867,579.13. The funding source for the expenditure is TIF District #4 with \$1,200,000 budget for the entire project including engineering. Cost for the project will be charged to the following Account Numbers:

404.505.5355.210 #419507.03, TID #4 Construction	\$788,709.13
404.505.5355.210 #419507.04, TID #4 Contingency	\$78,870.00

RECOMMENDATION

Suggested Public Services Committee Motion: Motion to recommend to the Common Council the base bid of Musson Brothers, Inc. in the amount of \$728,259.77, plus Alternates 1 and 2 in the amount of \$60,449.36, total bid of \$788,709.13 for the Collins Lot Reconstruction. As per City Policy, this is a unit priced bid with the actual cost based on the units required to complete the work. A 10% contingency (\$78,870) is allowed for the construction with any expenditures exceeding the approved bid amount plus the contingency requiring Common Council approval. Net approved project cost of \$867,579.13.

SUGGESTED MOTION

Suggested Common Council Motion: Motion to approve resolution 20-R2887 for the reconstruction of the Collins Street Parking Lot.

RESOLUTION NO. 20-R2887

RESOLUTION APPROVING COLLINS PARKING LOT CONSTRUCTION BID

WHEREAS, the City of Oconomowoc budget provides for the Reconstruction of the Collins Street Parking Lot; and

WHEREAS, on July 7, 2020 the Common Council approved the concept for the lot and directed staff to move forward with the engineering and bidding process; and

WHEREAS, plans and specifications for the parking lot project were completed and advertised with four bids received as follows on August 20, 2020:

Musson Brothers, Inc	\$ 728,259.77
Super Western, Inc	\$ 828,198.73
Poblocki Paving Corporation	\$ 998,877.00
Zignego Company, Inc	\$1,228,822.27

and

WHEREAS, Department of Public Works staff and the Public Services Committee recommend that the bid of Musson Brothers, Inc. be accepted; and

WHEREAS, Department of Public Works staff and the Public Services Committee recommend both Alternates 1 and 2 at a cost of \$60,449.36 be accepted.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT HEREBY RESOLVED the \$728,259.77 bid from Musson Brothers, Inc. be and the same is hereby accepted, and appropriate City officials are authorized to enter into a contract with Payne and Dolan for said project.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Alternates 1 and 2 at a cost of \$60,449.36 be accepted for a total bid cost of \$788,709.13.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this is a unit price contract with estimated quantities, and accordingly the actual quantities and therefore the final contract price may vary.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED a 10% contingency of \$78,870, net project cost of \$867,579.13, is allowed for the construction with any expenditures exceeding the approved bid amount plus the contingency requiring Common Council approval.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this resolution not become effective and no notice of award be issued unless and until an appropriate performance bond and a certificate of insurance are filed with the City Clerk.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that all project costs be charged to the following accounts:

404.505.5355.210 #419507.03, TID #4 Construction	\$788,709.13
404.505.5355.210 #419507.04, TID #4 Contingency	\$78,870.00

DATED: _____

CITY OF OCONOMOWOC

ATTEST:

By: _____
Robert P. Magnus, Mayor

Diane Coenen, Clerk